To Accreditation Council Of Eurasian Center for Accreditation And Quality Assurance In Higher Education and Health Care 04.03.2022

#### REPORT

#### OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION BASED ON THE RESULTS OF EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME <u>7R01140 – "PHYSICAL MEDICINE AND REHABILITATION</u> OF ADULTS AND CHILDREN" OF NEI "KAZAKHSTAN - RUSSIAN MEDICAL UNIVERSITY" FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS OF POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION PROGRAMMES (SPECIALTY OF RESIDENCY) IN MEDICAL ORGANIZATIONS OF EDUCATION

external expert evaluation period: 16-18 February 2022

Almaty, 2022

#### TABLE OF CONTENTS

· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	6
2.1.	Presentation of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" and	6
	educational programme in the specialty - 7R01140 – "Physical Medicine and	
	Rehabilitation of Adults and Children"	
2.2.	Information on previous accreditation	8
2.3.	Conclusion on the results of the review of the report on the self-assessment of	
	the educational programme 7R01140 – "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of	8
	Adults and Children" for compliance with the Standards of Accreditation of	
	Postgraduate Education Programmes (Residency Specialty) of Medical	
	Organizations of Education and conclusions	
3.	Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion	9
4.	Results of the survey of teachers and residents	14
5.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results	16
	of an external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01140 -	
	"Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults and Children"	
6.	Recommendations for improving the educational programme 7R01140 –	28
	"Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults and Children"	
7.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	28
	Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria of external evaluation and educational	32
	programme of the residency in the specialty 7R01140 – "Physical Medicine and	
	Rehabilitation of Adults and Children"	
	Attachment 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation	33
	Attachment 3. Organization Visit Programme	

RoK Republic of Kazakhstan   MoH RK Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan   MES of RK Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan   GD RoK Government Decree of the RK   NEI Non-State educational institution   ECAQA Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in higher Education and Health care   SCES State compulsory standard of education   HEI higher education institution   OHPE Organization of higher and postgraduate education   SC Scientific Council   CEP Committee of Educational Programmes   AMP Adademic Council   CEP Committee of Educational Programmes   DP&CEP Department of planning and control of the educational process   CED Catalog of elective disciplines   CIS Control measuring instruments   QEP Quality of the educational process   AC Attestation Committee   RIWP Resident Individual work plan   RIWP Resident Individual work plan   RIWT Resident Individual work plan   RIW <t< th=""><th>Abbreviation</th><th>Designation</th></t<>	Abbreviation	Designation
MES of RKMinistry of Education and Science of the Republic of KazakhstanGD RoKGovernment Decree of the RKNEINon-State educational institutionECAQAEurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in higher Education and Health careSCESState compulsory standard of educationHEIhigher education institutionOHPEOrganization of higher and postgraduate educationSCScientific CouncilACAcademic CouncilCEPCommittee of Educational ProgrammesAMPAdministrative and managerial staffTSTeaching staffTCCTraining and Clinical CenterEPEducational programmeDP&CEPDepartment of planning and control of the educational processCEDCatalog of elective disciplinesCISControl measuring instrumentsQEPQuality of the educational processACAttestation CommitteeRIWPResident Individual work planRIWTResident Individual work under the supervision of a teacherIWSIndependent work of the student (resident)EPLCurriculumWCWork CurriculumTEPTypical educational planRWResearch workEECExternal expert commissionNLANormative legal actsEMSEmergency medical servicesPHCPrimary health careEDMEmergency medical services	RoK	Republic of Kazakhstan
MES of RKMinistry of Education and Science of the Republic of KazakhstanGD RoKGovernment Decree of the RKNEINon-State educational institutionECAQAEurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in higher Education and Health careSCESState compulsory standard of educationHEIhigher education institutionOHPEOrganization of higher and postgraduate educationSCScientific CouncilACAcademic CouncilCEPCommittee of Educational ProgrammesAMPAdministrative and managerial staffTSTeaching staffTCCTraining and Clinical CenterEPEducational programmeDP&CEPDepartment of planning and control of the educational processCEDCatalog of elective disciplinesCISControl measuring instrumentsQEPQuality of the educational processACAttestation CommitteeRIWPResident Individual work planRIWTResident Individual work under the supervision of a teacherIWSIndependent work of the student (resident)EPLCurriculumWCWork CurriculumTEPTypical educational planRWResearch workEECExternal expert commissionNLANormative legal actsEMSEmergency medical servicesPHCPrimary health careEDMEmergency medical services	MoH RK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
NEI Non-State educational institution   ECAQA Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in higher Education and Health care   SCES State compulsory standard of education   HEI higher education institution   OHPE Organization of higher and postgraduate education   SC Scientific Council   AC Academic Council   CEP Committee of Educational Programmes   AMP Administrative and managerial staff   TS Teaching staff   TCC Training and Clinical Center   EP Educational programme   DP&CEP Department of planning and control of the educational process   CED Catalog of elective disciplines   CIS Control measuring instruments   QEP Quality of the educational process   AC Attestation Committee   RIWP Resident Individual work plan   RIWP Resident Individual work under the supervision of a teacher   IWS Independent work of the student (resident)   EPL Curriculum   WC Work Curriculum   REP <td>MES of RK</td> <td></td>	MES of RK	
ECAQAEurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in higher Education and Health careSCESState compulsory standard of educationHEIhigher education institutionOHPEOrganization of higher and postgraduate educationSCScientific CouncilACAcademic CouncilCEPCommittee of Educational ProgrammesAMPAdministrative and managerial staffTSTeaching staffTCCTraining and Clinical CenterEPEducational programmeDP&CEPDepartment of planning and control of the educational processCISControl measuring instrumentsQEPQuality of the educational processACAttestation CommitteeRIWPResident Individual work planRIWTResident Individual work under the supervision of a teacherIWSIndependent work of the student (resident)EPLCurriculumWCWork CurriculumTEPTypical educational planRWResearch workEECExternal expert commissionNLANormative legal actsEMSEmergency medical servicesPHCPrimary health careEDMEmergency and Disaster MedicineMTBMaterial and technical base	GD RoK	Government Decree of the RK
Education and Health careSCESState compulsory standard of educationHEIhigher education institutionOHPEOrganization of higher and postgraduate educationSCScientific CouncilACAcademic CouncilCEPCommittee of Educational ProgrammesAMPAdministrative and managerial staffTSTeaching staffTCCTraining and Clinical CenterEPEducational programmeDP&CEPDepartment of planning and control of the educational processCISControl measuring instrumentsQEPQuality of the educational processACAttestation CommitteeRIWPResident Individual work planRIWTResident Individual work under the supervision of a teacherIWSIndependent work of the student (resident)EPLCurriculumWCWork CurriculumTEPTypical educational planRWResearch workEECExternal expert commissionNLANormative legal actsEMSEmergency medical servicesPHCPrimary health careEDMEmergency and Disaster MedicineMTBMaterial and technical base	NEI	Non-State educational institution
Education and Health careSCESState compulsory standard of educationHEIhigher education institutionOHPEOrganization of higher and postgraduate educationSCScientific CouncilACAcademic CouncilCEPCommittee of Educational ProgrammesAMPAdministrative and managerial staffTSTeaching staffTCCTraining and Clinical CenterEPEducational programmeDP&CEPDepartment of planning and control of the educational processCISControl measuring instrumentsQEPQuality of the educational processACAttestation CommitteeRIWPResident Individual work planRIWTResident Individual work under the supervision of a teacherIWSIndependent work of the student (resident)EPLCurriculumWCWork CurriculumTEPTypical educational planRWResearch workEECExternal expert commissionNLANormative legal actsEMSEmergency medical servicesPHCPrimary health careEDMEmergency and Disaster MedicineMTBMaterial and technical base	ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in higher
HEIhigher education institutionOHPEOrganization of higher and postgraduate educationSCScientific CouncilACAcademic CouncilCEPCommittee of Educational ProgrammesAMPAdministrative and managerial staffTSTeaching staffTCCTraining and Clinical CenterEPEducational programmeDP&CEPDepartment of planning and control of the educational processCISControl measuring instrumentsQEPQuality of the educational processACAttestation CommitteeRIWPResident Individual work planRIWTResident Individual work under the supervision of a teacherIWSIndependent work of the student (resident)EPLCurriculumWCWork CurriculumWCExternal expert commissionNLANormative legal actsEMSEmergency medical servicesPHCPrimary health careEDMEmergency and Disaster MedicineMTBMaterial and technical base		
HEIhigher education institutionOHPEOrganization of higher and postgraduate educationSCScientific CouncilACAcademic CouncilCEPCommittee of Educational ProgrammesAMPAdministrative and managerial staffTSTeaching staffTCCTraining and Clinical CenterEPEducational programmeDP&CEPDepartment of planning and control of the educational processCISControl measuring instrumentsQEPQuality of the educational processACAttestation CommitteeRIWPResident Individual work planRIWTResident Individual work under the supervision of a teacherIWSIndependent work of the student (resident)EPLCurriculumWCWork CurriculumWCExternal expert commissionNLANormative legal actsEMSEmergency medical servicesPHCPrimary health careEDMEmergency and Disaster MedicineMTBMaterial and technical base	SCES	State compulsory standard of education
OHPEOrganization of higher and postgraduate educationSCScientific CouncilACAcademic CouncilCEPCommittee of Educational ProgrammesAMPAdministrative and managerial staffTSTeaching staffTCCTraining and Clinical CenterEPEducational programmeDP&CEPDepartment of planning and control of the educational processCEDCatalog of elective disciplinesCISControl measuring instrumentsQEPQuality of the educational processACAttestation CommitteeRIWPResident Individual work planRIWTResident Individual work under the supervision of a teacherIWSIndependent work of the student (resident)EPLCurriculumWCWork CurriculumTEPTypical educational planRWResearch workEECExternal expert commissionNLANormative legal actsEMSEmergency medical servicesPHCPrimary health careEDMEmergency and Disaster MedicineMTBMaterial and technical base	HEI	
ACAcademic CouncilCEPCommittee of Educational ProgrammesAMPAdministrative and managerial staffTSTeaching staffTCCTraining and Clinical CenterEPEducational programmeDP&CEPDepartment of planning and control of the educational processCEDCatalog of elective disciplinesCISControl measuring instrumentsQEPQuality of the educational processACAttestation CommitteeRIWPResident Individual work planRIWTResident independent work under the supervision of a teacherIWSIndependent work of the student (resident)EPLCurriculumWCWork CurriculumTEPTypical educational planRWResearch workEECExternal expert commissionNLANormative legal actsEMSEmergency medical servicesPHCPrimary health careEDMEmergency and Disaster MedicineMTBMaterial and technical base	OHPE	
CEPCommittee of Educational ProgrammesAMPAdministrative and managerial staffTSTeaching staffTCCTraining and Clinical CenterEPEducational programmeDP&CEPDepartment of planning and control of the educational processCEDCatalog of elective disciplinesCISControl measuring instrumentsQEPQuality of the educational processACAttestation CommitteeRIWPResident Individual work planRIWTResident Individual work under the supervision of a teacherIWSIndependent work of the student (resident)EPLCurriculumWCWork CurriculumTEPTypical educational planRWResearch workEECExternal expert commissionNLANormative legal actsEMSEmergency medical servicesPHCPrimary health careEDMEmergency and Disaster MedicineMTBMaterial and technical base	SC	Scientific Council
AMPAdministrative and managerial staffTSTeaching staffTCCTraining and Clinical CenterEPEducational programmeDP&CEPDepartment of planning and control of the educational processCEDCatalog of elective disciplinesCISControl measuring instrumentsQEPQuality of the educational processACAttestation CommitteeRIWPResident Individual work planRIWTResident Individual work under the supervision of a teacherIWSIndependent work of the student (resident)EPLCurriculumWCWork CurriculumTEPTypical educational planRWResearch workEECExternal expert commissionNLANormative legal actsEMSEmergency medical servicesPHCPrimary health careEDMEmergency and Disaster MedicineMTBMaterial and technical base	AC	Academic Council
TSTeaching staffTCCTraining and Clinical CenterEPEducational programmeDP&CEPDepartment of planning and control of the educational processCEDCatalog of elective disciplinesCISControl measuring instrumentsQEPQuality of the educational processACAttestation CommitteeRIWPResident Individual work planRIWTResident independent work under the supervision of a teacherIWSIndependent work of the student (resident)EPLCurriculumWCWork CurriculumTEPTypical educational planRWResearch workEECExternal expert commissionNLANormative legal actsEMSEmergency medical servicesPHCPrimary health careEDMEmergency and Disaster MedicineMTBMaterial and technical base	CEP	Committee of Educational Programmes
TCCTraining and Clinical CenterEPEducational programmeDP&CEPDepartment of planning and control of the educational processCEDCatalog of elective disciplinesCISControl measuring instrumentsQEPQuality of the educational processACAttestation CommitteeRIWPResident Individual work planRIWTResident independent work under the supervision of a teacherIWSIndependent work of the student (resident)EPLCurriculumWCWork CurriculumTEPTypical educational planRWResearch workEECExternal expert commissionNLANormative legal actsEMSEmergency medical servicesPHCPrimary health careEDMEmergency and Disaster MedicineMTBMaterial and technical base	AMP	Administrative and managerial staff
EPEducational programmeDP&CEPDepartment of planning and control of the educational processCEDCatalog of elective disciplinesCISControl measuring instrumentsQEPQuality of the educational processACAttestation CommitteeRIWPResident Individual work planRIWTResident independent work under the supervision of a teacherIWSIndependent work of the student (resident)EPLCurriculumWCWork CurriculumTEPTypical educational planRWResearch workEECExternal expert commissionNLANormative legal actsEMSEmergency medical servicesPHCPrimary health careEDMEmergency and Disaster MedicineMTBMaterial and technical base	TS	Teaching staff
DP&CEPDepartment of planning and control of the educational processCEDCatalog of elective disciplinesCISControl measuring instrumentsQEPQuality of the educational processACAttestation CommitteeRIWPResident Individual work planRIWTResident independent work under the supervision of a teacherIWSIndependent work of the student (resident)EPLCurriculumWCWork CurriculumTEPTypical educational planRWResearch workEECExternal expert commissionNLANormative legal actsEMSEmergency medical servicesPHCPrimary health careEDMEmergency and Disaster MedicineMTBMaterial and technical base	TCC	Training and Clinical Center
CEDCatalog of elective disciplinesCISControl measuring instrumentsQEPQuality of the educational processACAttestation CommitteeRIWPResident Individual work planRIWTResident independent work under the supervision of a teacherIWSIndependent work of the student (resident)EPLCurriculumWCWork CurriculumTEPTypical educational planRWResearch workEECExternal expert commissionNLANormative legal actsEMSEmergency medical servicesPHCPrimary health careEDMEmergency and Disaster MedicineMTBMaterial and technical base	EP	Educational programme
CISControl measuring instrumentsQEPQuality of the educational processACAttestation CommitteeRIWPResident Individual work planRIWTResident independent work under the supervision of a teacherIWSIndependent work of the student (resident)EPLCurriculumWCWork CurriculumTEPTypical educational planRWResearch workEECExternal expert commissionNLANormative legal actsEMSEmergency medical servicesPHCPrimary health careEDMEmergency and Disaster MedicineMTBMaterial and technical base	DP&CEP	Department of planning and control of the educational process
QEPQuality of the educational processACAttestation CommitteeRIWPResident Individual work planRIWTResident independent work under the supervision of a teacherIWSIndependent work of the student (resident)EPLCurriculumWCWork CurriculumTEPTypical educational planRWResearch workEECExternal expert commissionNLANormative legal actsEMSEmergency medical servicesPHCPrimary health careEDMEmergency and Disaster MedicineMTBMaterial and technical base	CED	Catalog of elective disciplines
ACAttestation CommitteeRIWPResident Individual work planRIWTResident independent work under the supervision of a teacherIWSIndependent work of the student (resident)EPLCurriculumWCWork CurriculumTEPTypical educational planRWResearch workEECExternal expert commissionNLANormative legal actsEMSEmergency medical servicesPHCPrimary health careEDMEmergency and Disaster MedicineMTBMaterial and technical base	CIS	Control measuring instruments
RIWPResident Individual work planRIWTResident independent work under the supervision of a teacherIWSIndependent work of the student (resident)EPLCurriculumWCWork CurriculumTEPTypical educational planRWResearch workEECExternal expert commissionNLANormative legal actsEMSEmergency medical servicesPHCPrimary health careEDMEmergency and Disaster MedicineMTBMaterial and technical base	QEP	Quality of the educational process
RIWTResident independent work under the supervision of a teacherIWSIndependent work of the student (resident)EPLCurriculumWCWork CurriculumTEPTypical educational planRWResearch workEECExternal expert commissionNLANormative legal actsEMSEmergency medical servicesPHCPrimary health careEDMEmergency and Disaster MedicineMTBMaterial and technical base	AC	Attestation Committee
IWSIndependent work of the student (resident)EPLCurriculumWCWork CurriculumTEPTypical educational planRWResearch workEECExternal expert commissionNLANormative legal actsEMSEmergency medical servicesPHCPrimary health careEDMEmergency and Disaster MedicineMTBMaterial and technical base	RIWP	Resident Individual work plan
EPLCurriculumWCWork CurriculumTEPTypical educational planRWResearch workEECExternal expert commissionNLANormative legal actsEMSEmergency medical servicesPHCPrimary health careEDMEmergency and Disaster MedicineMTBMaterial and technical base	RIWT	Resident independent work under the supervision of a teacher
WCWork CurriculumTEPTypical educational planRWResearch workEECExternal expert commissionNLANormative legal actsEMSEmergency medical servicesPHCPrimary health careEDMEmergency and Disaster MedicineMTBMaterial and technical base	IWS	Independent work of the student (resident)
TEPTypical educational planRWResearch workEECExternal expert commissionNLANormative legal actsEMSEmergency medical servicesPHCPrimary health careEDMEmergency and Disaster MedicineMTBMaterial and technical base	EPL	Curriculum
RWResearch workEECExternal expert commissionNLANormative legal actsEMSEmergency medical servicesPHCPrimary health careEDMEmergency and Disaster MedicineMTBMaterial and technical base	WC	Work Curriculum
EECExternal expert commissionNLANormative legal actsEMSEmergency medical servicesPHCPrimary health careEDMEmergency and Disaster MedicineMTBMaterial and technical base	TEP	Typical educational plan
NLANormative legal actsEMSEmergency medical servicesPHCPrimary health careEDMEmergency and Disaster MedicineMTBMaterial and technical base	RW	Research work
EMSEmergency medical servicesPHCPrimary health careEDMEmergency and Disaster MedicineMTBMaterial and technical base	EEC	External expert commission
PHCPrimary health careEDMEmergency and Disaster MedicineMTBMaterial and technical base	NLA	Normative legal acts
EDMEmergency and Disaster MedicineMTBMaterial and technical base	EMS	Emergency medical services
MTB Material and technical base	PHC	Primary health care
	EDM	Emergency and Disaster Medicine
PD Profiling Disciplines	MTB	Material and technical base
	PD	Profiling Disciplines

#### LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

#### 1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with the ECAQA Order No. 02 dated 02.02.2022, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) was formed to conduct accreditation of 7R01140 – "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults and Children" in the period of 16-18.02.2022, consisting of the following:

№ п/п	Status as part of EEC	Full name	Regalia, position, place of work/place of study, course, specialty	
1	chairperson	Turgunov Yermek Meiramovich	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Surgical Diseases of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda", President of the NEI "Surgical Association of Karaganda Region", member of the International Surgery Society	
2	Foreign Expert	Ruslan Abdullaevich Nasyrov	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Vice-Rector for Scientific Work, Head of the Department of Pathological Anatomy with a Course of Forensic Medicine St. Petersburg State Pediatric Medical University of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation, Member of the New York Academy of Sciences	
3	Foreign Expert	Tatyana Vasilyevna Pozdeeva	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Economics, Management and Medical Law. Dean of the Faculty of Medicine and Prevention and the Faculty of Higher Nursing Education of the Volga Research Medical University of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation, Nizhny Novgorod	
4	Kazakh Academic Expert	Zhumalina Akmaral Kanashevna	National Academic expert, MD, Professor, Head of the Department of Pediatric Diseases with Neonatology of the NJSC "WKMU named after Marat Ospanov"	
5	Kazakh Academic Expert	Ermukhanova Lyudmila Sergeevna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Public Health and Public Health NJSC "WKMU named after Marat Ospanov", trainer for training of the Oshi of the Western region.	
6	Kazakh Academic Expert	Akhmetova Almira Kalikapasovna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of dermatovenerology and cosmetology NJSC Semey Medical University	
7	Kazakh Academic Expert	Kudabaeva Khatimya Ilyasovna		
8	Kazakh Academic Expert	Sadieva Zhanar Zamankhanovna	anesthesiologist-resuscitator, head of the Department of Postgraduate Education South Kazakhstan Medical Academy JSC.	
9	Kazakh Academic Expert	Zhunusova Aigul Bitimbayevna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, doctor – pediatrician of the highest category, director of the Department of Academic Work of	

			Semey Medical University NJSC.
10	Kazakh	Tuleutaeva Raykhan	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the
	Academic	Esenzhanovna	Department of Pharmacology and Evidence-Based
	Expert		Medicine, Semey Medical University.
11	Kazakh	Tezekbaev Kanat	Head of the Department of Traumatology and
	Academic	Mardenovich	Orthopedics
	Expert		NJSC "Asfendiyarov KazNMU"
	-		
12	Kazakh	Eltai Utemuratovich	PhD, Deputy Director of the Master's Degree in
	Academic	Rakhmanov	Sports Medicine and Rehabilitation, Instructor,
	Expert		School of Medicine, Nazarbayev University,
			organizer of educational, practical and research
			work of undergraduates in sports medicine and
			rehabilitation
13	Employers'	Zhazira	Deputy Chief Physician for Children IDP
	representative	Dzhumabekovna	City Polyclinic No.29
	-	Moldabaeva,	
14	Resident	Ermekbai Aibek	Resident of the second year of study in the
	Representative	Amanzholuly,	specialty "Anesthesiology and resuscitation,
			including pediatric"
			NJSC " Asfendiyarov KazNMU

The observer for ECAQA is Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna, Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department.

The work of the ECAQA was carried out in accordance with the Regulation on the ECAQA (Order of the Director General of ECAQA No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The ECAQA report contains an assessment of 7R01140 – "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults and Children" for compliance with the Standards of Accreditation of Postgraduate Education Programmes (Residency Specialty) of Medical Organizations of Education and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the ECAQA for further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above educational programme and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

#### 2. General part of the final report

2.1 Introduction of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" of the educational programme 7R01140 – "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults and Children"

programme / Roll to Thysical M	curcine and Renaphication of Hadits and Chinaren
Organization name, legal form of	Non-governmental educational institution "Kazakhstan-
ownership, bin	Russian Medical University", 970 240 002 300
	The supreme body – the general meeting of participants
Management hady	Executive body – Rector
Management body	Control body – Audit Commission
	Collegiate body – Academic Council
Full name of the chief executive	Dzhainakbayev Nurlan Temirbekovich
officer	
Created on	1992 у.
Location and contact details	71, Torekulova str., Almaty
State license for educational	license for educational activities AB No. 0137388, issued
activities in the residency (date,	by the Committee for Control in the Field of Education
number)	and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of

	the Republic of Kazakhstan on June 2, 2010
Information on branches, subsidiaries (if any)	no.
Year of implementation of the accredited educational programme (EP)	Year 2021
Duration of training	2 years
Total number of graduates since the beginning of EP implementation	11 graduates transferred from KazMUNO
Number of residents on EP since the beginning of the current year	17 trainees
Full-time trainers/ Combiners involved in the implementation of EP, incl. % of degree	3/3, 50%

The NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" (hereinafter – the University) was established in 1992 as the Kazakhstan Medical Institute (KMI). In 2010, KMI was renamed into Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University (certificate of state re-registration No. 9833-1910-U-e dated May 4, 2010).

NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" is an educational institution that provides students with competitive higher and postgraduate medical education with a state diploma.

The NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" implements 35 educational programmes of the residency. In 2021, there was the first set of residents in the specialty 7R01140 – "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults and Children". The University has released 11 residents transferred from the Joint Stock Company "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education". In the first year there are 2 residents, in the second year there are 15 residents. The number of residents in the specialty 7R01140 – "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults and Children" are 15 residents.

The educational programme of the specialty 7R01140 – "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults and Children" is aimed at training specialists who are able to meet the needs of society in the provision of medical care, apply and develop advanced innovative technologies in practice and science, use the achievements of information and communication technologies, strengthen the health of the population.

Studying in the residency in the specialty 7R01140 – "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults and Children" is carried out in full-time, the term of study is 2 years. According to the SERP, the educational programme for training residents is designed for 140 credits: core disciplines: a mandatory component – 132 credits, a component of choice – 4 credits, interim certification – 2 credits, final certification – 2 credits. The EP is designed to take into account the needs of the population from rehabilitation at the stationary stage to supportive rehabilitation at the place of residence.

Training of residents in the specialty 7R01140 – "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults and Children" is carried out in multidisciplinary medical clinics and form a patient-centered style of work aimed at ensuring the safety of patients, their correct identification, effective communication, improving the safety of examination and treatment, reducing injuries, and compliance with continuing treatment.

Training in the residency goes with a focus on practice, so theoretical training is 10%, clinical work 75%, independent work 15%.

Training of residents on clinical bases is carried out under the guidance of curators, who are appointed from among the faculty members who have the academic degree of doctor, candidate of medical sciences, as well as the highest or first qualification category. In addition to the supervisor, the resident is assigned a mentor – a physician of practical health care who has high qualifications. Degree

of TS is 50%. Fixing mentors on medical bases allows residents to work daily with modern equipment and medical equipment of clinics. Mentors take an active part in the training of young specialists, pass on to the young specialist, the accumulated experience of professional skills, and teach the most rational techniques and advanced methods of work.

When working with residents, training is carried out using updated protocols, treatment recommendations, own and borrowed implementations in clinical practice. Residents are required to participate (including on-line) conferences and seminars in training seminars, symposiums, trainings, master classes. For work on the Internet on the basis of the university and on clinical bases there is an Internet connection. The use of modern advances in medicine forms cognitive competencies that lead to the development of practical skills, and also contributes to the development of the need for continuous professional development.

The ability to formulate, analyze and document the results of scientific research in the form of publications and reports is a mandatory result of training in the residency. Residents are involved not only in the theoretical study of modern achievements of evidence-based medicine, but also in the description of clinical cases, the analysis of statistical material initiated by doctors of clinical bases or employees of the department/course. Residents work in a scientific circle, participate in scientific competitions, are performers of scientific projects. The conduct of research and publication is positively assessed when assessing the portfolio of residents.

The work of residents at the PMC is included in the EP as a mandatory component. Among the checklists of the resident's activity there is a checklist for assessing the conduct of sanitary and educational work with patients. Residents participate in charitable events – Open Days, volunteer movement, formation of image, sanitary and educational events, work on quarantine sites, in provisions and infectious hospitals during the coronavirus epidemic.

Due to the unfavorable epidemiological situation, academic mobility with leading national and regional educational, scientific and clinical institutions has been suspended. Residents have permanent free access to electronic library resources, but there is a need to expand access to evidence-based, practical databases, in particular to subject-specific databases (e.g., sources of evidence-based physical medicine) and to widely implement innovative teaching methods using audio-visual platforms to simulate the purpose of rehabilitation activities and therapeutic exercises.

#### 2.2 Information on previous accreditation

Accreditation of the educational programme of the residency in the specialty 7R09141 – "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults and Children" has not been carried out so far.

# 2.3 Conclusion on the results of the review of the report on the self-assessment of the educational programme 7R09141 – "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults and Children" for compliance with the Standards of Accreditation of Postgraduate Education Programmes (Residency Specialty) of Medical Organizations of Education and conclusions

The self-assessment report of the Residency Education Programme in the specialty 7R09141 – Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults and Children (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 124 pages of the main text, appendices on 13 pages, copies or electronic versions in twenty folders located at

https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1bSVjvUJD9rUsDuEVW8Nssn7foK4fTU1r.

The report is characterized by the completeness of responses to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for the self-assessment of the educational programme provided to the organization of education by the accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as the internal unity of information. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by the head of the medical organization of education – Rector Dzhainakbayev N.T., Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, which confirms the reliability of quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of members of the internal commission on self-assessment with an

indication of the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the self-assessment of the educational programme: Yessengaraeva S.D., Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Course of Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Postgraduate Education; Yelemesova M.T., Director of the Department of Financial Work; Kasimova S.Yu., Head of the Administrative and Legal Department; Verevkina V.I., Head of the Personnel Department; Olzabaev S.T., Candidate of Medical Sciences, Director of the State Clinical Hospital "Almaty Regional Oncology Dispensary"; Zaitov I.F., Resident Doctor in the specialty 7R01140 – "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation for Adults, Children", 2 year of study.

The self-assessment of the educational programme of the residence in the specialty 7R09141 – "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults and Children", was carried out on the basis of the order of the head No. 26-02-50/1-n/k dated 01.07.2021 "On preparation for accreditation and organization of the process of self-assessment of educational programmes".

The report was reviewed by Rakhmanov's accreditation expert Yeltai Utemuratovich, and the reviews noted strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions and changes, including the following:

Standards	Reviewer (s) Recommendations		
2	According to paragraph 2.3.2 "The medical organization of education should organize		
	the implementation of the educational programme with due attention to the safety and		
	autonomy of patients", it is necessary to consider the possibility of introducing		
	simulation training in physical medicine and rehabilitation at the Training and Clinical		
	Center.		
3	Provide solutions for remote examination and using online proctoring system tools.		
4	Provide information (perspective plan) on the involvement of residents as a laboratory		
	technician, trainee teacher in the work of departments, clinical bases, research centers		
	of the university.		
5	Describe the process of optimizing the balance between teaching, research and care.		
6	Provide information (perspective plan) on the connection to the database of scientific		
	evidence-based practice and innovative methods of training in Physical Medicine and		
	Rehabilitation online resources for video materials; platforms for the appointment of		
	rehabilitation activities and therapeutic exercises, etc.		
8	Describe the programme's relevance to the health needs of the population and the		
	provision of medical services.		

Thus, in the process of feedback from the representative of the educational organization, experts received answers to the questions that arose and the self-assessment report was amended accordingly and additions were made to the recommendations of the reviewers.

In all standards, the real practice of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" on the training of residents in the specialty 7R09141 – "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults, Children" is given, taking into account the beginning of admission of students in 2021, reasoned data, examples of implementation of the tasks of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is sufficiently complete and updated in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on the selection and admission, the results of training, the results of the assessment of knowledge and skills, the material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, plans for development and improvement, etc.

The report is submitted to ECAQA in a completed form, with correction of the data on the above recommendations, written in competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criterion of standards, tables and figures (diagrams) contain references in the text and have end-to-end numbering.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure, the external assessment. The experts plan to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be obtained during the visit to the educational institution, i.e. verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

#### **3.** Description of the external expert evaluation

External expert work within the framework of the assessment of the educational programme of the residency in the specialty 7R09141 – "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults, Children" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the External Evaluation of Educational Organizations and Educational Programmes of ECAQA (approved by the order of the Director General of the NU "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in higher Education and Health Care» No.5 dated February 17, 2017) and in accordance with the programme approved by the Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. dated February 2, 2022 and agreed with the Rector of the KRMU Dzhainakbayev N.T.

The external evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying the indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is presented in detail in the Visit Programme (hereinafter referred to as the Programme), which is contained in the documentation of the accreditation center and in Attachment 3 to this report. The programme is evidence of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of an external expert evaluation.

Foreign expert - Pozdeeva Tatyana Vasilievna (Russian Federation) participated in a face-to-face format, the participation of a foreign expert Nasyrov Ruslan Abdullayevich (Russian Federation) is provided on the zoom platform (video recordings are archived in the accreditation body).

To obtain objective information, the EEC members used the following methods and their results:

- interview with management and administrative staff a total of 10 people;
- interviews with residents 17 people in total;
- studying the website https://krmu.edu.kz/kz/;
- interviewing of 7 employees, 43 teachers;
- questionnaires of teachers and residents 113 and 200, respectively;
- observation of the training of residents: one lecture ("Fundamentals of medical rehabilitation", Andasova Zh.M. Group: PMR 21-01, Base: Rehabilitation Center "Rekinetics" (sanatorium "Kazakhstan"), Visit to a journal club. Subject: "Work with sources to prepare for the implementation of a scientific project", residents in the specialty "Neonatology", room 717b;
- review of resources in the context of the implementation of accreditation standards: one base of practice/clinical engagement was visited, including the Rehabilitation Center "Rekinetics" (sanatorium "Kazakhstan"), where training is conducted on one educational programme with the participation of 3/3 of full-time teachers/ part-time employees;
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 14 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the units (the list of studied documents is in Attachment 2).

The staff of the accredited organization ensures the presence of all persons indicated in the visiting programme and according to the lists of interviews and interviews (Table 1).

N⁰	Full name	Job Title
1.	1. Dzhainakbayev Nurlan Temirbekovich Rector, professor	
2. Imanbaeva Zhaysan Abilseitovna Vice-rector for scientific a		Vice-rector for scientific and clinical work
3.	3. Kusainova Arman Sailavbekovna Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs	
4.	4. Tatyana Anatolyevna Sovostyanova Acting Vice-Rector for Educational Work	
5.	Esengarayeva Saule Damirovna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, interviews with EEC members

		the Department of Physics Medicine and		
		Reabilitation		
6.	Tanabaeva Gulmira Sharbinovna	lecturer		
7.	Andasova Zhanar Murzakalievna	lecturer		
8.	Doskozhaeva Saule Temirbulatovna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Senior Lecturer		
9.	Petrova Natalia Petrovna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Senior Lecturer		
10.	Suleimenova Zauri Imanbekova	doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Senior Lecturer		
11.	Idris Rashidovich Rasulov	Department lecturer		
12.	Abdulina Venera Ravilievna	candidate of Medical Sciences, Senior Lecturer of the Department		
13.	Stepanova Irina Stanislavovna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Senior Lecturer of the Department		
14.	Kenzhebaeva Kamila Seitkamalovna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Senior Lecturer of the Department		
15.	Bazarbekova Rimma Bazarbekovna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department		
16.	Svetlana Usikovna Kazaryan	lecturer of the department		
17.	Ermakhanova Tamara Ozbekbayevna	Senior Lecturer of the Department		
18.	Kim Maksim Igorevich	Resident Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation (PMR)		
19.	Nurmukhanov Dauren Kozhagulovich	PMR Resident		
20.	Azimkhanova Zhadyr Askarkyzy	PMR Resident		
21.	Bodykova Akbayan Askarovna	PMR Resident		
22.	Bolatkyzy Ainur	PMR Resident		
23.	Demesinova Gulbanu Alpysbaikyzy	PMR Resident		
24.	ZaitovIlyarFarkhatovich	PMR Resident		
25.	Zamanbekova Zhuldyz Salimbekovna	PMR Resident		
26.	Kerey Ilyas Nurlanuly	PMR Resident		
27.	Kozybagar AizhanUmrozakkyzy	PMR Resident		
28.	Kudaibergen Sergey Seyitzhapparuly	PMR Resident		
29.	Myrzali Togozhan Dulatkyzy	PMR Resident		
30.	Nurmasheva Aigerim Nurlankyzy	PMR Resident		
31.	Saduakas Muldir Ergalykyzy	PMR Resident		
32.	Sarsenbek Ulukbek Mussabekuly	PMR Resident		
33.	Lyudmila Nikolaevna Shamerzaeva	PMR Resident		
34.	Muldagalieva Diana	PMR Resident		

Thus, when implementing the activities of the programme, namely, based on the results of the interview with the first head of the organization, members of the Committee of educational programmes, in interviews with residents and teachers, compliance with the criteria of **Standard 1** was established. All participants in the educational process know the mission of the organization, took part in the formation of proposals for the formulation of the mission, while the mission was brought to the attention of potential residents through the website, social networks, information letters to medical organizations. The strategic plan of the organization for the period of 5 years, including such areas as:

1. Ensuring the quality of the educational process integrated with modern achievements of science and practice;

2. Internationalization of education and integration into the international educational space;

3. Development of research potential of the university and integration of science with the clinic;

4. Development of corporate governance and management in the field of quality;

5. Staff development and capacity-building of faculty;

6. Formation of socially active student life;

7. Introduction of new educational programmes (opening of new specialties and areas of training aimed at development

postgraduate studies (Master's degree and PhD) and the opening of an international medical school;

8. Improvement and development of professional practice;

9. Development of continuous professional education to increase the competitiveness of specialists in the market

intellectual and high-tech work;

10. Image formation;

11. Infrastructure as a way forward;

12. Formation of the image of a leader in medical education of Kazakhstan through compliance with the criteria of national ratings of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

This confirms compliance with the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the organization. From interviews with residents, it was established that before the beginning of classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the organization of education, tell where to get the necessary information about the educational programme, teachers, training bases. This indicates compliance with **Standard 2** in terms of adapting training to the needs of residents.

The organization's documents contain work programmes, EMCD, which define the goal, take into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, independent work. Compliance with the SCES and standard requirements has been established. Attending the practical lesson on "Hip Kinesitherapy", the volume of hours 1, the experts received convincing data that the training is carried out according to the plan, before the beginning of the lesson, the residents answer the tests, receive feedback from the teacher, have the opportunity to improve their skills in physical medicine and rehabilitation. The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational programme, since the experts studied the Code of Academic Integrity of Students, the Code of Corporate Culture and Ethics (June 1, 2018) and during the interview the residents replied that they were informed about the content of this document.

When attending the practical lesson "Kinesitherapy of a hip joint", the volume of hours 1, and conversation with residents, experts saw that the organization promotes the development of practical competencies of residents, including on simulation equipment. At the same time, residents deepen their theoretical knowledge, develop communication skills.

The analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in advisory disciplines are taken into account, additions are made to the bibliography of the EMCD and syllabuses, and teachers apply them in classes.

A review of the measurement tools (two tests, two tasks) showed that the organization has implemented an appropriate evaluation policy that allows for a multifaceted assessment of the learning achievements of residents. During the interview, the residents told about the forms of assessment, for example, control, essays, term papers and that they were satisfied with everything. They also receive regular feedback from teachers. The system of appealing the results of the assessment is reflected in the document "Model Rules for Admission to Education in the Organization of Education Implementing Professional Academic Programmes of Postgraduate Studies" Order No.600, the Rules for Admission to Residency and during the period of work of the organization of education there were no precedents for appeal. Thus, compliance with standard 3 has been established.

During the visit to the organization and during the interview with Professor Esengarayeva Saule Damirovna - Head of the Department of Rheumatology, Medical Rehabilitation and Sports Medicine, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Doctor of Rehabilitation, the Commission made sure that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and employees, and includes such documents as annual operational plans, annual reports, provisions of divisions, contracts with teachers and residents, and educational and methodological documentation (work programme, work curricula, syllabuses, journals), evaluation tools (checklists, statements), certificates and certificates. A review of the website showed that its pages contain the necessary documents for residents to obtain the necessary documents for admission and information about student support services, residents receive information from stands in departments/courses, in the Residence Department and through the website of the University www.medkrmu.kz, where the Rector's blog, an internal information forum and information about the National Helpline for Children and Youth also functions. This information was obtained during an interview with Orakbai Lyazzat Zhadigerovna, Head of the Residence Department.

The conversation with Vera Ivanovna Veryovkina, the Head of the Personnel Department, included such issues as personnel policy, working conditions and allowed experts to learn about approaches to attracting employees of clinical bases for teaching (a total of 6 such teachers), about the strategy and tactics of recruitment of residents, information security of the educational programme, as well as to identify problems in the management and development of human resources, since most part-time teachers do not know the teaching methodology.

Interviews with 12 teachers, including 12 full-time teachers, showed that there are both successes and problems in managing education, depending on the specific base (admission of residents to equipment, sufficient number of thematic patients, time for maintaining medical records, independent work). Experts received answers about the programme of professional development of teachers, financing of this training, availability at teachers of certification on methods of teaching.

On the same day, experts studied materials on the admission of residents and the selection of teachers and established compliance with standard 4. The conversation with representatives of student self-government, which includes active residents ("Meeting with the resident asset"), revealed that resident associations and organizations do not participate in the process of developing the policy of admission and selection of residents.

In order to verify the data of Standard 5, external experts received an opinion on personnel policy and approaches to the development of teachers' pedagogical competence, motivation to work with residents, and mentoring. Experts found that teachers initiate research topics for residents, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature, medical documentation. Questions were asked about the main scientific directions of the university, the contribution of the department to the development of the scientific direction of the university, methods of motivating identities for conducting research. During the conversation, the experts found out that the main priority scientific direction of the NEI "KazRosmeduniversity" is developing innovations for implementation in practical health care, including the development of mobile medicine for the rural population. To this end, an initiative research was carried out on the topic: "Improving the provision of medical care to residents of rural regions at the level of primary health care using mobile complexes". Since the staff of the department joined the university at the beginning of the academic year from "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" JSC, the faculty are ready to integrate and develop scientific projects in the priority areas of the university. At the moment, on the basis of "LOCK " Ok-Zhetpes" JSC, scientific research is carried out and residents are attracted as volunteers, the motivation is the further admission to the doctoral studies.

During the visit to the clinical base - Rekinetix Rehabilitation Center, Dostyk, 308, where experts conducted a survey of resources, their compliance with training programmes, accessibility for teachers and residents, as far as this equipment is modern and meets the needs of students and practical health care. Experts obtained evidence of compliance with Standard 6, as well as validation of the information in the self-assessment report.

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report and to obtain evidence on the quality of the programmes, interviews were conducted with residents in the specialty. Experts asked questions about satisfaction with the training, enough time for patient supervision, work in Damumed with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for residents in need, participation in "Journal Clubs", availability of international databases of professional literature. In general, residents are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization, since they believe that the organization of education has good resources, image and international relations, at the same time, residents would like more independence in the management of patients, the conduct of international events. But there is a need to expand access to evidence-based, practical databases, in particular subject-specific databases (for example, sources of evidence-based physical medicine and rehabilitation) and to widely implement innovative teaching methods using audio-visual platforms to simulate the purpose of rehabilitation activities and therapeutic exercises. Due to the unfavorable epidemiological situation, the possibility of studying in alternative educational institutions is not provided and the regional and international exchange of teachers and residents is suspended.

Residents showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering the questions of external experts, demonstrated their judgment on the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, the opportunity to participate in research, funding when answering the questions of foreign experts Professor Nasyrov Ruslan Abdullayevich and Professor Pozdeeva Tatyana Vasilyevna. Experts studied the documents of residents (portfolio, results of assessment of residents - checklists, results of questionnaires of residents).

Interviews with 14 employers were conducted online and offline by one employer and included such issues as: knowledge of the university mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals in the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, participation in the development of the educational programme, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in the training of residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, about the problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, % of employment of residency graduates, ways to motivate residency graduates to choose their organization for employment, etc.

The review of resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, for example, the clinical bases of the Rekinetix Rehabilitation Center were visited, and employees of the educational organization provide a collegial and ethical relationship with medical personnel, the management of the clinical base to achieve the final results of residents. A sufficient number of thematic patients, modern equipment and demonstrates accessibility to students are provided, and employees who simultaneously perform the roles of teachers and mentors (mentors) provide high-quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. Before starting the relevant discipline of the educational programme, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during the training.

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. The final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme, the study of documents, the results of the interview, interviews, questionnaires was held. EEC members started designing the final EEC report. The results of the external evaluation are summarized. Experts individually completed the "Quality Profile and Criteria for External Evaluation of the Educational Programme 7R01140 – Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults and Children" for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards. No comments were made by the EEC members. The recommendations for improving the educational programme were discussed, and the chairperson, Professor Turgunov Yermek Meiramovich, held a final open vote on the recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council on the accreditation period – 5 years.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all the necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University", a high degree of openness of the team in providing information to the members of the EEC.

At the end of the programme of the visit, the Chairperson of the EEC for the management and employees of the organization of education announced recommendations on the results of an external assessment within the framework of specialized accreditation.

**Conclusion:** Resident associations and organizations should be involved in the process of formulating admission and selection policies. There is a need to expand access to evidence-based, practical databases, in particular subject-specific databases (for example, sources of evidence-based physical medicine and rehabilitation), and to widely implement innovative teaching methods using audio-visual platforms to simulate the purpose of rehabilitation activities and therapeutic exercises. It is also recommended to provide the opportunity to study in alternative educational institutions and to improve the regional and international exchange of teachers and residents.

#### 4. Results of the survey.

The ECAQA observer conducted an online questionnaire on 16-18.02.2022 at https://webanketa.com/.

#### The resident survey includes 22 questions.

In total 200 people (in total 307 residents for the current year) answered.

Of the total number of respondents, 51.5 per cent were residents of the first year, followed by 33.5 per cent residents of the second year, 11.5 per cent residents of the third and fourth years, and 3.5 per cent graduates.

This university will be recommended as an organization of education – 87.5% fully agree, 11% partially. Fully agree 89% of those surveyed and 9% partially agree that programme managers and faculty are aware of their learning challenges. Fully (87.5%) and partially (10.5%) satisfied with the conditions and equipment of the teaching rooms, classrooms of the university. According to 82.5% (fully) and 14.5% (partially) of office equipment is available for residents on the basis of practice. Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes - fully agree 87%, partially – 11.5%. Fully (85.5 per cent) and partially (11 per cent) satisfied with the library collection and resources. Eighty-eight per cent of respondents have access to e-education resources, and 9 per cent consider it partial.

According to 87%, the organization of clinical training for residents fully satisfies them, and 11.5% partially. There is sufficient time for practical training (patient supervision, etc.) -95% fully agree, 4% partially. Satisfied with the methods of assessing my knowledge and skills -90% completely agree, 9.5% partially. According to 90.5 per cent of teachers in the classroom, active and interactive teaching methods are used regularly, and according to 7 per cent, rarely.

According to 90% of respondents, teachers constantly provide feedback after completing classes, but according to 7.5% - sometimes and 1.5% - rarely. Fully satisfied that study in higher education 93.5%, partially 5.5%, disappointed – 1% of respondents. Completely (93%) and partially (6%) satisfied with the organization of teaching at the KRMU.

The work of the EEC was assessed as positive -89.5%, satisfactory -7.5%, i.e. the majority.

**The teacher survey included 21 questionnaire questions.** In total 113 people (in total in the staff 484) answered, thus pedagogical experience till 5 years – at 28,32%, till 10 years - 22,12%, more than 10 years - 49,56%.

74.34% are completely satisfied with the organization of the educational process, and 22.12% are partially satisfied. The university observes ethics and subordination completely agree 86.73%, partially -11.5%. Fully satisfied with the organization of work and workplace 75.22% of respondents, partially 23.01%. In the organization there is an opportunity for career growth and competence development to teachers - 70.8% completely agree, partially -22.12%.

In this educational institution, teachers have the opportunity to do scientific work and publish the results of research – 75.22% fully agree, partly 16.81%. 83.19% of respondents are completely satisfied with the work of the personnel service, 13.27% – partially. Half of those surveyed underwent further training during the year. Only 81.42% fully agree that they can be implemented as

professionals, and 13.27% - partially. Unfortunately, 33.63% did not answer the question whether the university supports the teacher in participating in international and republican events, and 30.97% did not address this to the management or relevant administrative employees of the university. The majority of respondents (73.45%) fully agree, and 22.12% partially agree that the discipline that is taught is provided with sufficient resources (classrooms, equipment). 38.94% are unaware of the implementation of social programmes to support teachers and doubt their availability 10.62% of respondents. The management and administration systematically listen to the opinion of teachers – 65.49%, sometimes – 18.58% of respondents. Various teaching methods are used in the education of students, but more often the analysis of situational tasks (75.22%), oral surveys (61.06%), less often they rewrite thematic information from monographs (10.62%). Completely according to 70.8% that this questionnaire will be useful for the development of recommendations for improving the university and educational programmes of the residency, 14.16% partially agree with this.

The results of the survey are presented in the annex and demonstrate the effective management of educational programmes, the positive aspects of training in residency programmes, at the same time determine areas for improvement (social support programmes for teachers, support for the teacher's university in participating in international and national events, pedagogical competencies and teacher development).

## 5. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01140 – "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults and Children"

#### Standard 1: MISSION AND END OUTCOMES

#### **Evidence of compliance:**

#### **1.1 Mission statement and deliverables**

KRMU widely informed the public, the health sector and all interested persons about the declared mission. According to the mission, the University implements innovative, socially-oriented, practice-oriented projects in accordance with international practice. The mission is designed to be responsive to the needs of society and health care delivery systems, as well as other aspects of social responsibility. The educational programme contains theoretical and practical components that strengthen the clinical training of the resident, which makes it possible to professionally orient the graduate of the residency as a highly professional specialist in demand in the health care system of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Corporate governance based on the principles of collegiality and openness of decisions, separation of governing bodies and their responsibilities, financial transparency has been introduced in university. The University organizes targeted meetings with employers in the coordination of educational programmes, catalogues of elective disciplines (CED); representatives of employers are members of the Clinical Council

CMR, where issues related to the implementation of the Mission are discussed.

The University provides a patient-oriented and holistic approach to the care and treatment of patients in its clinics and guarantees appropriate working conditions to support its own health of residents. Training in the residency goes with a focus on practice, so theoretical training is 10%, clinical work 75%, independent work 15%.

The University promotes innovations in the learning process that allow the development of the basic and special competencies of residents and encourages residents in their desire to become scientists/researchers in their chosen field of medicine, including deeper and/or wider participation in the academic development and improvement of scientific research. Through the involvement of scientific, social and professional projects, the University assists residents in their formation as active participants in solving social determinants of health.

**1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy** 

As a result of training, the resident in the specialty 7R01140 – "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults and Children" receives a holistic vision of processes, the ability to select an effective and safe treatment, which generally determines the individual approach to patients – the autonomy of decisions in favor of the patient. The resident, under the supervision of a manager / mentor, receives special knowledge, develops practical skills, for the assessment of which formative and summative assessment is used. The formation of this skill requires solid theoretical knowledge, stable practical skills, work with scientific literature. The EP presents the list of practical skills recommended by the SCES, their number and level of performance of competencies. Patient supervision, duty is performed by residents independently under the supervision of a mentor.

#### **1.3 Learning outcomes**

KRMU determined the final results of training of residents in the achievement of knowledge, skills and thinking that residents received at the postgraduate level. In the EP for the specialty 7R01140 – "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults and Children", developed within the framework of the State Standardization of Social Welfare (Order No.647 in the revision of 2020) and the Qualification Characteristics of a Doctor (Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 21, 2020 No. KR DSM-305/2020 "On approval of the nomenclature of specialties and specializations in the field of health care, the nomenclature and qualification characteristics of the positions of health care workers"), the main final results of the training of a resident are taken into account. The Department pays considerable attention to compliance with the standards of conduct and the Code of Academic Integrity of Students, the Code of Corporate Culture and Ethics (June 1, 2018). The EP is focused on the expectation of the employer and the needs of the labor market, coordination of the elements of the EP, CED is carried out with employers. Employers, members of professional associations are involved in the review of the EP, participation in the discussion of the results at the meetings of the CEP, scientific and practical meetings of the University. **1.4 Participation in the formulation of the mission and final results** 

The main (internal) stakeholders involved in the process of forming the mission of the EP include: students, teachers, clinical mentors attracted from clinical bases, administrative staff, advisory bodies of the MEO, graduates.

The correct formulation of the Mission is an important condition for its understanding and acceptance by the staff of the University, the residents. The wording and content of the mission of the EP residency was based on the mission of the university within the framework of the SCES and the qualification characteristics of the doctor.

When forming the programme, its goals, and final results, discussions were held at the level of: student audience, graduates (discussion of opportunities), department employees (discussion in a working group, at a meeting of departments / courses), at A meeting of the CEP (dated 14.05.2020 No.5), at the Academic Council (dated 28.08.2020 No.5), and the Academic Council of the University (dated 12.08.2020 No.5).

Adjustments were made to the overall structure of the programme and to the formulation of its objectives and results. When uploaded to the Republican Register of Educational Programmes, it was reviewed and then adjusted with the participation of external reviewers.

External stakeholders involved in the formulation of the mission and deliverables include: employers (including potential), National socio-professional associations, health care organizations.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 17 standards: full – 17. *Standard 1: Implemented* 

There are no **recommendations**.

#### Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME Evidence of compliance:

#### 2.1 Postgraduate programme framework

The educational process at the university is organized in accordance with the "Rules for the organization of the educational process on credit technology of education" (Order of the Ministry of

Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 20.04.2011 No.152). Credit technology involves increasing the responsibility of students for the learning process. The NEI "KazRosMedUniversity" has developed a model of competence of residents, prescribed in the EP (Attachment, Table 1), approved at the meeting of the University Council (Minutes No.10 dated June 19, 2019) and including the following structure: patient supervision; communication and collaboration; safety and quality; public health; research: is able to formulate adequate research questions, critically assess professional literature, effectively use international databases in its daily activities, participate in the work of the research team; training and development: is able to learn independently and train other members of the professional team, actively participate in discussions, conferences and other forms of continuous professional development.

#### 2.2 Scientific method

Each discipline of EP 7R01140 - "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults and Children» includes training from the standpoint of evidence-based medicine, management of scientific research and public health, teaching the search for reliable and high-quality information, the ability to differentiate it in terms of value and effectively use it in clinical practice and research work.

The uniqueness of the NEI "KazRosMedUniversity" is the development of innovations for implementation in practical health care, including the development of mobile medicine for the rural population. To this end, an initiative research was carried out on the topic: "Improving the provision of medical care to residents of rural regions at the level of primary health care using mobile complexes". Since the staff of the department joined the university at the beginning of the academic year from "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" JSC, the faculty are ready to integrate and develop scientific projects in the priority areas of the university. At the moment, on the basis of "LOCK " Ok-Zhetpes" JSC, scientific research is carried out, and residents are attracted as volunteers, the motivation is the further admission to the doctoral studies.

#### **2.3 Content of the residency programme**

The content, scope and sequence of the courses of the EP of the residence in the specialties strictly correspond to the SCES. At the heart of the achievement of training objectives in the specialty is the acquisition by residents of the necessary knowledge and key competencies that profile (PGE) the disciplinary component and the component of choice (CC). Clinical work of residents during training is carried out under the guidance of teachers, supervisors, clinical mentors. When forming the EP for the specialty 7R01140 - "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults and Children", the following factors were taken into account: the contribution of each discipline to the formation of competencies at a certain level (course), i.e. the responsibility of both specialized and related disciplines for the formation of a competent graduate, the definition of competencies in each discipline.

The educational programme for training residents in the specialty 7R01140 – "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation for Adults, Children" is designed for 140 credits: core disciplines - 132 credits, a component of choice -4 credits, interim certification -2 credits, final certification -2 credits.

#### 2.4 Programme structure, content and duration

The content of the academic disciplines of the mandatory component is strictly regulated by the State Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan 2020 and is reflected in the standard curricula of the disciplines of the specialty. EP in the specialty 7R01140 - "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults and Children" gives the opportunity to residents during the entire training to plan and implement an individual, directed learning path, preparing for work in the chosen specialty. Ensuring the guaranteed high quality of the educational process is determined by the quality of planning. The number of hours per two years of training is 4,200. With a two-year training programme, residents master 140 loans, 4 of which fall on CC - elective disciplines. The list of elective disciplines of the component is compiled according to the Catalogue of Elective Disciplines, which is formed and approved annually at the university. The number of hours of the elective component (elective disciplines), their correlation with the mandatory disciplines are regulated by the SCES RoK. Thus, 4 loans were allocated for the PA and for the FSA. Total 132 credits are allocated for mastering the core disciplines (mandatory).

#### 2.5 Organization of training

When drawing up the staffing table for the new academic year, for conducting classes for residents, the mandatory requirement for teachers is the presence of an academic degree, academic title and work experience. It should also be noted that a number of requirements are imposed on the staff involved in teaching residents from practical health care - the availability of a medical qualification category and sufficient experience in the specialty.

The number and composition of teaching staff is formed on the basis of the needs of the educational process, the normative educational load on one full-time teacher and the contingent of students in accordance with the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No.606 "On approval of the average ratio of the number of students to teachers to calculate the total number of faculty of higher and(or) postgraduate education organizations and is a ratio of 1:3.

#### 2.6 Relationship between postgraduate medical education and health care

The presence of clinical bases in the largest multidisciplinary clinics and polyclinics in Almaty and the regions provides residents with the opportunity to master the process of patient management tactics in outpatient settings, continuity between the primary and inpatient levels of care, interaction as part of a multidisciplinary team, rehabilitative care in remote regions of the country. Supervision of 9-10 patients allows residents to master diagnostic and therapeutic procedures in the course of daily clinical activities. Multidisciplinary clinics have a wide profile of departments and patients with pathological conditions, which allows residents to see and supervise a sufficient number of patients with a variety of pathologies corresponding to the cycle of disciplines. Based on the above, the organization of medical education provides opportunities for the relationship between postgraduate medical education and the provision of medical care.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 30 standards: full - 30. *Standard 2: Implemented There are no recommendations.* 

#### Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS Evidence of compliance:

#### **3.1 Methods of evaluation**

General policy, principles, methods of assessment of residents in the specialty 7R01140 – "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults, Children" at the University are reflected in the following internal documents: Academic Policy of the University, Regulations on the current monitoring of academic performance, interim and final certification of students in the NEI "KazRosMedUniversity". The list of mandatory disciplines for the final control during the academic period is regulated by the completed disciplines, which are reflected in the WEP. The form of the midterm and final control is approved by the Academic Council. For testing, a technical specification is drawn up – a matrix of test tasks, which is reflected in the syllabuses. To ensure maximum objectivity and transparency of the evaluation process, the department / course has developed checklists for conducting current, milestone and final control of the discipline (Mini-cEX, CbD, OSCE).

#### **3.2 Relationship between evaluation and training**

The assessment methods are fully comparable to the teaching and learning methods and cover the assessment of all the competencies of students both during practical classes and during examinations. In the assessment of educational achievements, control and measurement tools developed by departments / courses are used, in various types (control questions, tasks in test form, tasks for laboratory work, practical and communication skills, etc.).

In addition, in EP 7R01140 - "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults and Children", 75% of the total number of hours is devoted to mentoring in each discipline. The mentors are representatives of practical health care, ensuring the horizontal integration of EP. Mentors take an

active part in the training of young specialists, pass on to the young specialist the accumulated experience of professional skills, teach the most rational techniques and advanced methods of work.

The conclusions of the EEC meet the criteria of 11 standards: 11 in full.

Standard 3: Implemented There are no recommendations.

#### Standard 4: STUDENTS

#### **Evidence of compliance:**

#### 4.1 Admission and Selection Policy

Criteria for applicants entering the residency are determined by the requirements of the State Standard of Education and Training of the Republic of Kazakhstan (2017, 2020), according to which the previous level of education of persons wishing to master the educational programmes of the residency: basic medical education, higher medical education, internship.

Transfer of residency students from one educational organization to another, from a paid basis for training on a state educational order to a vacant place for the remaining period of study is carried out during the vacation period in accordance with the Rules for placing a state order, admission to training and training of medical personnel in the residency, approved by the order of the Minister of Health of December 15, 2020 No. KR DSM-270/2020.

During the conversation with residents, the experts found that resident organizations or individual active residents are not involved in the process of developing the policy of admission and selection of residents and do not take into account their opinion obtained through feedback at this stage.

#### 4.2 Number of residents

The number of accepted residents is regulated by the state order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan for the training of medical personnel and taking into account the possibilities of clinical, practical training, the maximum permissible load on mentors, the availability of educational, methodological and scientific literature, the capacity of clinical bases, as well as the material and technical resources of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University".

According to the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 606 "On approval of the average ratio of the number of students to teachers to calculate the total number of faculty of higher and (or) postgraduate education organizations", the number of residents in the specialty 7R01140 – "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation for Adults, Children" is 1:3 per teacher.

#### 4.3 Resident support and advice

The University has mechanisms for adapting to study in the residency. Curators introduce to the new social environment, establish business and personal contacts between the members of the group; acquaint with the peculiarities of the educational process at the university, professional guidance, and provide assistance in the scientific organization of the work of residents.

The students of the residency have the opportunity to receive legal advice, psychological support from a regular teacher-psychologist.

Academic advisory work in the department/course consists of advising residents during the training and before the examination session.

#### 4.4 Representation of residents

The quality of the implementation of the educational programme is ensured by the participation of residents in the discussion of the mission of the University and the EP, access to which is available through posting on the University's website.

Students together with the university's teaching staff have a real opportunity to participate in the organization of the specialty's EP in the course of direct discussion and approval of work programmes, at the level of developing an individual work curriculum and elective disciplines.

Residents with feedback on the educational process contribute to the most adequate development of EP, other regulatory documents for the formation of a highly qualified specialist.

#### 4.5 Working conditions

Resident doctors are granted holidays between academic periods. The duration of holidays during the academic year is at least seven weeks, except for the final course, in accordance with the state compulsory standard of residency in medical specialties and the educational programme in the specialties of residency.

Combining training with work (no more than 0.5 hours) in areas of activity close to his future specialty in his free time with the consent of the supervisor, the head of the department and the head of the residency department.

In the presence of a specialist certificate, residents are allowed to conduct independent medical activities in public and private medical institutions, during extracurricular time.

The heads of the clinical bases of the residency provide for the introduction of resident doctors in the staffing structure of units providing medical services, and ensure the provision of workplaces for resident doctors for the duration of training at the clinical base.

Residents of the course of Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation are involved in the work of clinical bases. For example, 5 residents work as kinesiotherapists in the SC "Rekinetix", 6 residents are involved in the scientific work carried out together with the clinical base of JSC "LOC" Ok-zhetpes ".

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 30 standards: fully - 29, partially - 1, non-compliant - 0

#### Standard 4: Implemented

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Involve resident associations and organizations in the process of developing the policy of admission and selection of residents.

#### Standard 5: FACULTY

#### Evidence of compliance:

#### **5.1 Recruitment and Selection Policy**

The University pays great attention to the selection and recruitment of qualified personnel, as well as their training. The selection and recruitment of employees is carried out in accordance with the established requirements, taking into account basic and vocational education, as well as practical work experience, individual abilities, professional knowledge and other indicators. Analysis of the quantitative and qualitative composition of the teaching staff, monitoring and evaluation of pedagogical activities are the objects of constant attention on the part of the University management.

The total number of faculty members is formed on the basis of the average ratio of students and teachers -6:1; undergraduates and teachers -6:1; residents and teachers -3:1.

The share of full-time teachers of clinical disciplines with medical qualification categories is 44% with the highest category, 5.5% with the first, 1.9% with the second and 48% with a specialist certificate. The total number of full-time teachers of clinical departments/courses is 484. Priority is given to candidates with higher qualifications, skills of scientific and pedagogical, scientific, clinical activities, corresponding to the mission of the University.

#### 5.2 Teachers' obligations and development

The activities of the teaching staff are planned in accordance with the individual plan of the teacher, which is discussed and approved at the departmental meetings of the departments involved in the training of residents in the specialty 7R01140 – "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults and Children". The planning of the pedagogical workload of the faculty is carried out in academic hours. At the same time, the pedagogical load at the classroom classes is calculated by the contact time of the teacher with the flow, group, subgroup. For the direct management of the study group, the formation of an individual educational trajectory and preparation for the Final Certification, a curator is appointed from among the full-time faculty.

The system of professional and pedagogical improvement of the teaching staff of the NEI "KazRosmeduniverit" includes the following units: the School of the teacher, the Institute of

postgraduate education, winter and summer schools organized by the AWD, which contribute to the formation and development of the competence and potential of the teaching staff.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Comply with 7 of the standards: fully - 7, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not comply - 0.

Standard 5: Implemented There are no recommendations.

#### Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES Evidence of compliance:

#### 6.1 Logistics and equipment

Residency in the specialty 7R01140 – "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults and Children" has a significant material and technical base for the educational process. Equipped with all the necessary equipment, visual aids, educational material in electronic form, with methodological developments in each discipline, and innovative technologies for interactive teaching methods. This makes it possible to ensure that the educational process is conducted in accordance with educational standards.

The University Library does not have access to evidence-based, practical databases, in particular subject-specific databases. There is also a need to widely implement innovative teaching methods using audiovisual materials platforms to simulate the purpose of rehabilitation activities and therapeutic exercises.

As part of the implementation of innovative technology programmes, a mobile medical complex was established in 2009 to examine and provide free medical care to socially vulnerable groups and identify socially significant diseases (tuberculosis, oncology and cardiology).

Mobile medical complexes are used in preventive, screening, dispensary examinations and in the provision of counselling in rural PHC organizations and in socially vulnerable groups of the population on a charitable basis.

#### 6.2 Clinical Bases

The specialized disciplines of the resident in the specialty 7R01140 – "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation, Adult, Children's" are held on the basis of clinics: Rehabilitation Center Rekinetix, (ul. Zharokova, 20. Contract No. 97 dated 01.09.2021); Rehabilitation Center Rekinetix (Dostyk str., 308. Contract No. 97 dated 01.09.2021) JSC "LOC "Ok-Zhetpes".

The equipment of clinical bases contributes to the high-quality organization of the educational process and the provision of specialized and highly specialized inpatient and outpatient polyclinic care to the population of the region. The classrooms are equipped with personal computers, multimedia installations, office equipment. For a number of years, the clinic has been carrying out gradual work aimed at solving the problems of ensuring the safety of patients, students, and medical staff of the institution.

The total number of training rooms and auxiliary rooms provided at clinical facilities is 12,706.4 m<sup>2</sup>.

#### 6.3 Information technology

The university has formed databases of educational information resources, to which there is access from the intranet of the university. The distance learning system is based on AIS Moodle.

The University Library's collection is also universal in that it consists of documents posted on remote technical facilities.

Continuous training of teaching staff on working with world databases of scientific and scientific-methodological literature is conducted. Staff of the library, together with educational departments and the commission for the purchase of literature, constantly monitor both the library's collection and the electronic databases of printers offering educational, scientific and educational literature.

#### 6.4 Clinical Teams

The programme of training residents in the specialty 7R01140 – "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation for Adults, Children" to work in a team and effective interaction with other health care specialists includes direct work of residents together with employees of clinical bases in all spheres of their activity, participation in selector republican and city meetings, in scientific and practical conferences, work in multidisciplinary teams. Working in multidisciplinary teams when choosing the tactics of managing the most complex patients increases the responsibility of residents when they see that performance depends on the correct organization of team work. In such situations, the resident performs all work within his competence.

#### **6.5 Medical Research and Advances**

The main priority scientific direction of the NEI "KazRosmeduniversity" develops innovations for implementation in practical health care, including the development of mobile medicine for the rural population. To this end, initiative research was carried out on the topic: "Improving the provision of medical care to residents of rural regions at the level of primary health care using mobile complexes". Since the staff of the department joined the university at the beginning of the academic year from "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" JSC, the faculty are ready to integrate and develop scientific projects in the priority areas of the university. At the moment, on the basis of "LOCK " Ok-Zhetpes" JSC, scientific research is carried out, and residents are attracted as volunteers, the motivation is further admission to the doctoral studies.

#### **6.6 Education expertise**

Examination of the quality of the implemented educational programme of the residency is a mandatory stage of the educational process and is carried out by the following structures of the NEI "KazRosMedUniversity": departments (planning, development, implementation, monitoring, evaluation, revision of the EP), Committee of educational programmes (planning, development, monitoring, evaluation, revision of the EP), Department of academic work (coordination, control of compliance with the NLA, monitoring, evaluation of the EP), Residency Department (implementation, monitoring, revision of the EP), Department of strategic development and QMS (coordination, monitoring, evaluation, revision of the EP), Academic Council (approval, evaluation, revision of the EP), Training Council (approval, evaluation, revision of the EP). The composition of collegial advisory bodies (CEP, AC, SC) includes teachers, representatives of professional associations, employers, students.

#### 6.7 Training in other institutions

To organize and implement academic mobility, the University has organized an academic mobility department, which is actively working to establish partnerships with Kazakh and foreign universities, conducts a policy on their implementation with educational institutions and organizations of the Republic of Belarus, the Kyrgyz Republic, the Russian Federation, Turkey and France.

Due to the unfavorable epidemiological situation, academic mobility with leading national and regional educational, scientific and clinical institutions has been suspended.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 21 standards conform: fully - 18, partially - 3, non-compliant - 0

#### Standard 6: Implemented

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- Increase access to evidence-based, practical databases, in particular subject-specific databases (for example, sources of evidence-based physical medicine and rehabilitation) and widely introduce innovative teaching methods using audio-visual platforms to simulate the purpose of rehabilitation activities and therapeutic exercises;
- 2) Provide the opportunity to study in alternative educational institutions;
- 3) Improve regional and international exchange of teachers and residents;

#### Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION Evidence of compliance:

#### 7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms

Monitoring and evaluation of EP is carried out at all levels, a multilevel approach is used, including the profiling /graduating and related departments, the residency department, the specialized CEP of postgraduate education, the AWD, Academic Council, Scientific Council, the Career Center (general monitoring of the quality of educational programmes through a survey of stakeholders (employers, professional associations and students).

Recruitment of residents in the specialty 7R01140 – "Physical medicine and rehabilitation of adults, children" was carried out for the first time in 2021, the first graduation of residents in the specialty 7R01140 – "Physical medicine and rehabilitation of adults, children" was in 2021 (transferred from JSC "KazMUNO", orders dated 17.05.2021 No. 26-03-106-b/k, order dated 19.05.2021 No. 26-03-109-b/k, order dated 20.05.2021 No. 26-03-113-b/k).

#### 7.2 Feedback from teachers and residents

The NEI "KazRosMedUniversity" observes proper representation of stakeholders in assessing the processes and final results of resident training programmes. Thus, the CEP includes heads of the department/course, professors, associate professors, teachers of departments that provide the educational process in the relevant specialty, representatives of the student population. The composition of the AC, the CEP is approved by the Rector of the University.

The management system of the EP Residency provides for the participation of all stakeholders, including the health sectors, and reflects the responsibility of academic management. This is confirmed by feedback and reviews on the EP.

#### 7.3 Results of Residents and Graduates

In 2021, the direction of monitoring of the PSC and the Career Center carried out a sociological study "Satisfaction of employers with graduates of the NEI "KazRosMedUniversity ". 30 employers (60% response rate) from 6 oblasts and the city of Almaty were interviewed. The results of the survey of employers on the quality of training of graduates of the NEI "KazRosMedUniversity" for 2021 showed that no employer rated the quality of training as low.

#### 7.4 Stakeholder Engagement

The participation of a wide range of stakeholders in the evaluation and improvement of educational programmes at the university is provided by the authorized bodies in the field of education and health care (MoH RK), representatives of the public, professional organizations, as well as persons and structures responsible for postgraduate education: the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan; Departments of regional health care departments; Representatives of the Committee for the Control of Medical and Pharmaceutical Services and representatives of practical health care; Representatives of public associations of doctors.

#### 7.5 Procedure for Approval of Educational Programmes

The NEI "KazRosMedUniversity" has developed mechanisms for the approval of educational programmes, providing for the evaluation of programmes at the stages of planning, implementation, analysis of results and implementation of changes, which allows to monitor the process of implementation of EP and progress of residents, and ensures the identification and timely solution of emerging problems.

Examination of the EP is carried out by the CEP, for compliance with the SCES, approves the CEO according to the trajectories of training of a specialist, taking into account pre- and post-requisites, evaluates the choice of methods for assessing the results of training of residents. The CEP carries out systematic study and comprehensive assessment of EP in order to improve and guarantee quality (determining the value of the programme, achievement of the goal, implementation of tasks, the degree of compliance with the needs of society, the requirements of employers, the effectiveness of the training methodology), as well as assessment of educational and methodological support and support of the educational process, assessment of the quality of EP in the areas of specialization. For this purpose, an external evaluation of the EP is carried out by a competent representative of practical health care.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 15 standards conform: full – 15.

Standard 7: Implemented There are no recommendations.

#### Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION Evidence of compliance:

#### 8.1 Control

Coordination of the implementation, control and monitoring of the implementation of residency programmes in all licensed specialties is carried out by the residency department under the supervision of the vice-rector for clinical activities.

Assessment of residents and achievement of the final results of training under the residency programme is carried out on the basis of the final state certification. Every year, an order is issued by the rector on the conduct of the FSA and the composition of the certification commission.

Thus, the NEI "KazRosmedunivreshet" implements the EP for residency in accordance with the regulations approved by the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as the internal rules for the organization of the educational process in the residency.

#### 8.2 Academic Leadership

The activities of the Residency Department are managed by the head appointed to the position by the order of the rector. The Division is responsible for the following decisions: development and approval of the mission programmes, rules for the organization of the learning process in the resident office, recommendations for the recruitment of residents, training of residents. The Department monitors residents, maintains relations with the practical health care sector and resident alumni, interacts with other structural units of the University involved in the implementation and support of resident programmes (AWD, DP&CEP, DIT).

The organization of the educational process in the NEI "KazRosMedUniversity" is regulated by the working curriculum in the specialty 7R01140 – "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults and Children", the schedule of training sessions and IEP of the resident. Assessment of the organization of training at the department /course is carried out through the systematic control of departments/courses by the department.

For the purpose of effective management of the educational process, the successful implementation of the Model of medical education in the NEI "KazRosMedUniversity" there is a Committee of educational programmes (CEP).

#### 8.3 Training budget and resource allocation

The budget of KazRosmeduniversity is formed from two sources: the republican budget (state order for training of personnel of higher and postgraduate education, advanced training of medical workers, development of scientific research, transfers) and provision of paid educational services.

The faculty is the main resource for ensuring the mission of KazRosmeduniversity. In this regard, the University pays special attention to the processes of recruitment and training of personnel. The processes of selection and preparation of teaching staff include: determination of requirements for teaching staff, search and selection of candidates for vacant positions, availability of probationary period for new employees, evaluation of activities, continuous professional development of teaching staff, dissemination of existing experience between employees and others. Activities in this direction are regulated by the internal regulatory document "Personnel policy", "Regulations on competitive substitution of positions of faculty and researchers". Particular attention is paid to the continuous improvement of the provision of departments/courses by teachers with academic degrees and academic titles.

#### 8.4 Administration and Management

KazRosMedUniversity annually introduces changes and additions to the organizational structure. The staffing table of departments/courses providing educational programmes of the residency is approved annually taking into account changes in the number of students. According to Art.52 of the

Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" dated 27.07.2007. No. 319-III, the total number of faculty members is formed on the basis of an average ratio of residents and teachers -3:1.

Administrative and managerial, service and educational support staff is calculated on the basis of the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan "Rules for calculating the tuition fee of one student, postgraduate student, clinical resident (graduate student) in higher medical educational institutions within the country by state educational order" dated June 14, 2004 No.221.

The calculation of the pedagogical load of the teaching staff is carried out in accordance with the Standard Rules for the Activities of Higher Education Organizations (Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan No.499 dated May 20, 2013) and the state standard of education (Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No.387 dated July 29, 2009 and Order No.647 dated July 31, 2015) and is approved at the meeting of the Academic Council of the University.

#### **8.5 Requirements and regulations**

The mechanism of interaction of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University", as a state medical higher education institution, with the authorized bodies (Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan) and the health sector is regulated by: the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan; the implementation of State programmes, Decrees and orders; contracts and agreements with health management bodies; contracts and agreements with health care organizations; written appeals of authorized state bodies and medical organizations.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 15 standards conform: full - 15. *Standard 8: Implemented There are no recommendations.* 

#### **Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL**

#### **Evidence of compliance:**

An example of the process of continuous improvement, approaches to the implementation of EP specialty 7R01140 – "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults and Children", is the active participation of stakeholders (primarily representatives of employers) in the formation of an educational strategy that reflects the social responsibility of the university for the development of advanced innovative technologies in medical practice and science, the use of advances in information and communication technologies, as well as the improvement of public health.

Study, monitoring and evaluation of the educational programme 7R01140 – "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults and Children" is carried out at all levels, including the profiling/graduating and related departments, the profile Committee of educational programmes, the Academic Council. The NEI "KazRosMedUniversity" continuously improves the mechanisms for periodic review, study and evaluation of the educational programme 7R01140 - "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults and Children" and ensures the quality of the programme management process. The educational programme is regularly studied and evaluated through feedback from residents, faculty and stakeholders, including employers, as well as analysis of the academic achievements of residents.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 4 standards: fully – 4. *Standard 9: Implemented There are no recommendations.* 

### 6. Recommendations for improving the educational programme 7R09141 – "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults and Children":

1. Involve resident associations and organizations in the process of development of resident admission and selection policies (4.1.8);

2. Increase access to evidence-based, practical databases, in particular subject-specific databases (e.g., sources of evidence-based physical medicine and rehabilitation) and widely implement innovative teaching methods using audio-visual platforms to simulate the purpose of rehabilitation activities and therapeutic exercises (6.1.1);

3. Provide the opportunity to study in alternative educational institutions (6.7.1);

4. Improve regional and international exchange of teachers and residents (6.7.3).

#### 7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

Members of the EEC established the compliance of the educational programme 7R09141 – "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults and Children" with the Accreditation Standards and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend to the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit this programme for a period of 5 years.

		$\bigcap$
chairperson	Turgunov Yermek Meiramovich	1 - And
Foreign Expert	Ruslan Abdullaevich Nasyrov	pr1
Foreign Expert	Tatyana Vasilyevna Pozdeeva	dez /
Kazakh Academic Expert	Zhumalina Akmaral Kanashevna	
Kazakh Academic Expert	Ermukhanova Lyudmila Sergeevna	AD
Kazakh Academic Expert	Akhmetova Almira Kalikapasovna	h
Kazakh Academic Expert	Kudabaeva Khatima Ilyasovna	the
Kazakh Academic Expert	Sadieva Zhanar Zamankhanovna	- fr
Kazakh Academic Expert	Zhunusova Aigul Bitimbayevna	- Ching
Kazakh Academic Expert	Tuleutaeva Raykhan Esenzhanovna	Muy
Kazakh Academic Expert	Tezekbaev Kanat Mardenovich	Juy
Kazakh Academic Expert	Rakhmanov Eltai	de
	Utemuratovich	part want
Employers' representative	Zhazira Dzhumabekovna Moldabaeva	- Dela
Resident Representative	Ermekbai Abay Amanzholuly	Receipte
		margare

Observer for ECAQA M.A. Umarova

B

#### Attachment 1.

		l so	Es	stimation	
Standard	Evaluation Criteria	Number of standards	Fully compliant	Partially compliant	Not compliant
1.	MISSION AND END OUTCOMES	17	17	0	0
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMME	31	31	0	0
3.	ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS	11	11	0	0
4.	STUDENTS	30	29	1	0
5.	FACULTY	7	7	0	0
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	21	18	3	0
7.	PROGRAMME EVALUATION	15	15	0	0
8.	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	15	15	0	0
9.	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	4	4	0	0
	Subtotal:	151	147	4	0
			151		

### Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme (generalization)

# List of documents studied by the members of the EEC as part of the certification of the educational programme 7R09141 – "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation of Adults, Children" of NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University"

N₂	Name of the document	Identification number	Date of approval
1.	Personnel policy	R-01-23-01	25.12.2020
2.	Regulations on social support for students	P-03-21-06	21.06.2019
3.	Regulations on the Commission for ensuring the academic quality of the educational programme	PL-03-36-08	26.08.2021
4.	Regulation on the Test Committee	RB-03-18-04	28.10.2021
5.	Rules for admission to the residency	PR-03-11-05	24.07.2020
6.	Regulations on on-site training in internship and residency	PL-03-11-07	29.08.2019
7.	Teacher Honor Code		12.12.2017
8.	Regulations on the Organization of Training with the Use of Distance Education Technologies	PL-03-37-05	29.08.2019
9.	Regulation on the Board of Curators	PL-03-21-08	18.11.2019
10.	Regulation on the assessment of students' knowledge	PL-03-35-10	29.08.2019
11.	Regulations on the current monitoring of academic performance, interim and final certification of students	PL-03-35-11	29.08.2019
12.	Rules for Granting Academic Leave to Students	PR-03-35-12	29.08.2019
13.	Code of Academic Integrity	K-03-36-05	27.04.2019
14.	Rules of Internal Regulations for Students	PR-03-36-08	29.08.2019
15.	Regulations on the Committee for Educational Programmes	PL-03-17-06	29.08.2019
16.	Rules for using the "Anti-plagiarism. University" system	PR-03-17-10	29.08.2019
17.	Regulation on the processing, protection and storage of personal data of employees and students	PL-03-23-06	17.06.2019
18.	Clinical Instructor Statement	PL-03-11-08	17.06.2019
19.	Academic Policy	R-01-17-14	27.08.2021